

## Melasma treatment: a systematic review

Nicoleta Neagu<sup>1\*</sup>, Claudio Conforti<sup>2\*</sup>, Marina Agozzino<sup>2</sup>, Giovanni Francesco Marangi<sup>3</sup>, Silviu Horia Morariu<sup>1</sup>, Giovanni Pellacani<sup>4</sup>, Paolo Persichetti<sup>3</sup>, Domenico Piccolo<sup>5</sup>, Francesco Segreto<sup>3</sup>, Iris Zalaudek<sup>2</sup>, Caterina Dianzani<sup>3</sup>

1.

2. Dermatology Clinic, Maggiore Hospital of Trieste, Trieste, Italy

3. Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery Unit, Campus Bio-Medico University of Rome, Rome, Italy

4. Dermatology Clinic, Department of Clinical Internal, Anesthesiological and Cardiovascular Sciences, Sapienza University of Rome, Rome, Italy

5. Skin Center - Dermo Aesthetic Laser Centers, Avezzano, Italy

\* these authors have equally contributed

Word count: 4287 words

Tables: 6

Figures: 1

Corresponding author: Nicoleta Neagu

ORCID: 0000-0001-5452-7324

E-mail: neagunicoleta92@yahoo.com

*The authors received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. The authors declare no conflict of interest.*

## **Abstract**

Melasma is a common chronic refractory disorder of pigmentation affecting people with darker skin types. Overall prevalence varies between 8.8% and 40%, depending on the ethnicity of the population and the geographical area. Therapeutic management of melasma is challenging, with high recurrence rates which significant impacts on the quality of life. No single treatment is universally efficacious. Systemic treatments with tranexamic acid and polypodium leucotomatous had promising results, although the former was related to systemic side effects. Microneedling and peeling were also efficacious, although their superiority to topical hydroquinone, the gold standard in melasma treatment, remains to be established. Similarly, laser and light devices have been beneficial. However, recurrence rates remain high in all treatment groups. Combination therapies, either in double or triple combinations yielded the best results when compared to single therapies

dermatoscopic evaluation, in order to select the best treatment option, targeted at each melasma subtype.

**Key words:** melasma, tranexamic acid, peeling, microneedling, laser, intense pulsed light

## Introduction

Melasma, previously referred to as chloasma, is a common chronic refractory disorder of pigmentation affecting people with darker skin types, most commonly Fitzpatrick phototypes III-IV. Based on the ethnic makeup of the population, reported prevalence varies between 8.8% and 40%. (1,2) Clinically, it manifests as symmetric reticulated hypermelanosis and it can appear in three predominant facial patterns: centrofacial, malar, and mandibular.(3)

in the skin: epidermal, typified by a light brown coloration, dermal, exhibiting a bluish grey colour or mixed, seen in a dark brown shade.(4) However, *in vivo* reflectance confocal microscopy showed a heterogenous distribution of melanophages, thus indicating that all

(5) It is now thought that melasma is the result of a complex interaction between epidermal melanocytes, keratinocytes, dermal fibroblasts, mast cells, vascular endothelial cells, and hormonal, genetic, as well as UV influence.(6) Histopathologically, melasma is characterized by solar elastosis, basement membrane disruption, increased vascularization and increased mast cell count, which strongly indicate that melasma should also be regarded as a photoaging skin disorder.(7)

In a study by Rodríguez-Arámbula et al, conducted on 20 female patients with malar melasma, histopathological examination revealed significantly higher inflammatory infiltration of CD4+ T cells, CD68+ macrophages and mast cells, as compared to unaffected skin. Additionally, genetic and immunohistochemical analyses showed significant elevations in the expression of IL-17 and COX-2. This indicates that malar melasma contains chronic inflammatory cells and mediators which can be exacerbated by environmental stimuli, of which cumulative sun exposure is the most important. This might explain the recurrence of melasma as well as the favourable responses to topical anti-inflammatory treatments.(8)

DNA hypermethylation in melasma lesions were described by Campuzano-García et al. They showed significantly increased levels of DNA methyltransferases (DNMT1 and DNMT3) in melasma lesions as compared to perilesional skin. Additionally, DNMT levels decreased after the use of sunscreen in combination with either 0.05% retinoic acid, 4% niacinamide, or placebo,

which correlated with clinical improvement. Therefore, DNA methylation might also be involved in melasma etiopathogeny, which impacts on the future treatment measures.(9)

Due to treatment and outcome scoring system heterogeneity, we focused on the objective assessment of the therapies involved, categorized according to the procedure employed: topical creams and peelings, systemic, as well as physical treatments such as microneedling, lasers, intense pulsed light, high intensity focused ultrasound. We further analyzed treatments in categories of single, as well as double and triple combination treatments in search for the best associations. We summarized the results of the RCTs in Tables 2-6. In the treatment columns (A, B, C) we did not include any mention of priming before peeling procedures or SPF daily application considering that all patients used SPF as part of their routine melasma treatment.

## **Results**

A total of 492 articles were initially identified in the literature search, of which 162 were duplicates and 224 did not meet the inclusion criteria and were therefore removed. We selected 87 randomized controlled trials (RCTs), 9 reviews and 1 meta-analysis (Figure 1). A total of 4681 patients with melasma were included, for which different treatment measures were employed: systemic treatments (n=20), microneedling (n=16), peelings (n=10), topical creams and solutions (n=56), lasers (n=24), intense pulsed light (n=7

melasma treatments in their multitude and variability, in the case of systemic treatments, which have been used since as early as 2009, we decided to expand our search period and 6 additional RCTs were included: 2 for TXA, 1 for PLE, 1 for melatonin and 1 for procyanidin + vitamins A, C, E (13-30).

For PLE studies, in the comparison with placebo by Martin et al, the results were superior in the PLE group than in the placebo group(24). However, according to Ahmed et al, significant decrease in MI and MASI scores were noticed in both groups(14). This might be explained by the fact that all the patients also applied daily sunscreen. Furthermore, Chuah et al compared the effectiveness of PLE in addition to hydroquinone (HQ) 4% cream(15). They showed the superiority of PLE + HQ 4% cream, as compared to HQ 4% cream alone at weeks 8 and 12 of treatment, although at day 84 the difference was no longer statistically significant, even though the combination group had a 33% higher improvement of melasma. This might be explained by the high recurrence rates of melasma, irrespective of the treatment measure applied. Nevertheless, no adverse events were reported by the patients who were treated with PLE.

-control study, in addition to a topical lightening cream and found no difference in melasma improvement between the two groups(18). Similarly, the effects of melatonin, either topical or systemic or both, as well as procyanidin + vitamins A, C E have been scarcely studied. A significant decrease in MASI scores was obtained for the treatment and for the placebo groups, which can be explained by the beneficial effect of sunscreen application, as well as the low effectiveness of the systemic treatment. Mild, reversible adverse events have been reported in the melatonin, as well as procyanidin treatment groups.

TXA was the most studied agent, in different concentrations and dosages, as well as different delivery methods: oral tablets, topical creams, as well as cocktails for microneedling procedures. For its systemic effects, 12 RCTs have been conducted: either TXA versus placebo, or in addition to laser treatment, topical treatment, or part of microneedling sessions. In the placebo comparison, the TXA group had better results than the placebo group, although not statistically significant(16,17). Furthermore, recurrence rates were high in both groups. Oral TXA was used as an adjuvant tool to topical treatments and compared to the effect of topical treatments alone. In the HQ 4% cream combination(21,23,29), as well as in the TC cream combination(25,26), the

superiority of the combined treatment as compared to the topical treatment alone has been demonstrated. Similarly, oral TXA in combination with QSNY laser have demonstrated better results, as compared to oral TXA alone(13,27). However, relapses still occurred in either combination comparisons. TXA delivery systems were also compared: in the microneedling versus oral delivery method, the latter had significantly superior results in one study(22) and comparable results in the other(28). With regard to TXA dosage, one study compared the effects of either 500 mg, 750 mg, 1000 mg or 1500 mg daily(30). There were no significant differences between the 4 groups in terms of efficacy or safety profile. However, the rates of improvement positively correlated with treatment time and dosage. Important adverse events have been reported, especially after the oral delivery method of TXA: gastrointestinal upset, changes in menstrual periods, headache (Table 2).

### **Microneedling**

16 RCTs evaluating the effects of microneedling on melasma have been included in our review(31-43). All studies showed a significant decrease in melasma scores as compared to baseline. Further comparisons between microneedling cocktails, combinations with topical treatment, lasers and peeling have been assessed.

Cassiano et al conducted an interesting study on a group of 20 females: they performed two 3 mm punch biopsies, one before and one 7 days after the microneedling session. Histologically, they discovered significant melanin reduction, while clinically a significant decrease in mMASI score was noted(32).

former rendered superior results in a population with a majority of mixed type melasma(22) and the latter showed similar results in a population with a predominant epidermal type of melasma(28).

Regarding the cocktails used for microneedling sessions, Iraj et al demonstrated the superiority of a glutathione combination solution with 0.4 % TXA and 3% vitamin C and the absence of melasma relapse in either group at week 24(35). Additionally, Feng et al compared the efficacy of microneedling with a combination of TXA and reduced glutathione to topical application of HQ cream, with significantly better results in the glutathione-TXA microneedling group(42).

Microneedling therapy, combined with either topical TXA solution, HQ 4% cream or QSNYL demonstrated superiority to the topical and laser therapy alone(39 41). However, it did not significantly improve the effects of peeling(31).

## **Peeling**

Different peeling combination solutions have been tested for the treatment of melasma, including the following acids: salicylic acid (SA), glycolic acid (GA), azelaic acid (AzA), ascorbic acid (AsA), phytic acid (PA), mandelic acid (MA), trichloroacetic acid

All studies showed a significant decrease in melasma scores as compared to baseline(44 51).

GA 20% peel in combination with topical AA 20% cream was superior to the topical treatment alone(45). Additionally, the combination of topical ascorbic acid cream 5% and LFQSL with peeling agents were superior to the topical and laser treatments alone(50,51).

In the single versus multiple acid peeling solutions, there was no difference between GA peel and a combination of AzA, PA and resorcinol peel; neither between GA peel and combination of GA and TCA peel(46,47). However, the combination of TCA 20-25% and Jessner peeling rendered superior results to TCA alone(44).

## **Topical treatment**

Topical treatments have been extensively studied in the treatment of melasma(52 73). Either as single active ingredients or in different combinations, they have all been proved efficacious in decreasing melasma scores and have maintained a relatively high safety profile.



Hydroquinone cream was compared to several other topical treatments: TXA 5%, both conventional(54,74) and liposomal(55), lignin peroxidase(58), petroselinum crispum solution(65), 0.7% and 1.4% silymarin cream(68), 4% diacetyl boldine serum(69) and cosmetic product combination cream(57), all of which rendered comparable results to HQ cream formulas (2%, 3%, 4%). Conversely, in RCTs comparing HQ topical treatment to 1% flutamide cream(52) and 0.2% thiamidol cream(53), HQ was inferior in efficacy. However, in the HQ versus 5% methimazol cream comparison, the former maintained superior results. Erythema, dryness, burning sensation, pruritus were the most frequently reported adverse events in the HQ groups.

Cysteamine 5%, as well as licorice extract 4% were also efficacious in melasma treatment, however their effects were only compared to placebo(60,66,70), thus their superiority to other topical treatments has not been demonstrated as of yet. Triamcinolone injections, however, seem to yield better results than the Kligman formula containing HQ 5%, tretinoin 0.1%, dexamethasone 0.1%(59).

TXA combinations appeared to have a significant impact on hypervascular, inflammatory melasma(61). Azelaic acid 10% combined with d-panthenol 10% was superior to other azelaic acid formulas(67).

### **Lasers and Light Therapy**

Different light devices have been used in the treatment of melasma(75-80), either fractionated intense pulsed light (IPL) or conventional IPL, both with comparable MASI score decrease(80). Also, different fluences have been utilised, 10 J/ cm<sup>2</sup> and 13 J/ cm<sup>2</sup>, both with significant improvement from baseline(75). Combination therapies rendered superior results as compared to IPL alone: in association with microdermabrasion(76), topical TXA 2%(77) or triple combination cream(79).

Laser therapy has been extensively studied in melasma treatment(47,51,81-97). Various devices have been employed: fractional ablative CO<sub>2</sub> laser, fractional thulium laser, fractional picosecond laser, picosecond alexandrite laser, copper bromide laser, ablative pixel Erbium YAG laser (APEYL), pulsed dye laser (PDL), low-fluence Q-switched Nd: YAG laser (LFQS), long-pulse Nd: YAG laser (LPNY), Q-switched Nd: YAG laser (QSNY), fractional erbium YAG laser (FEYL), pixel Q-switched Nd: YAG laser (PQSNY), quick pulse-to-pulse laser (Q-PTP), super

skin rejuvenation device (SSR). These can be included into four main categories: pigment-specific (Q-switched and long-pulsed lasers, IPL), vascular (pulsed dye and Copper bromide lasers), fractional and ablative lasers(98). Among these, the non-ablative types are preferred in melasma treatment for their lower incidence of post-inflammatory hyperpigmentation due to direct damage to the skin. Q-switched lasers selectively target melanin chromophores, while IPL is believed to determine the upward shedding of melanosomes destroyed by QS laser. Vascular lasers might prove to be useful in inflammatory, hypervascular melasma(3).

The majority of the studies compared laser therapy alone to combination therapy, the latter rendering significantly better results(81,91,95). Similarly, combination therapy had significantly better results than topical therapy alone(83-85) or it rendered similar improvement rates(93,96). In a RCT by Hammami et al, Kligman formula for triple combination cream (TCC) was superior to copper bromide laser(88).

In the laser versus laser comparisons, different technology devices have been evaluated. FEYL combined with QSNYL and TCC cream was superior to QSNYL and TCC(82). Dual toning performed with LFQSNYL and LPNYL 1064 nm had significantly better results than QS toning with LFQSNYL(86). In a triple comparison between SSR, PQSNYL and APEYL, the latter had superior results, although not statistically significant as compared to the other two. Additionally, the effects on different types of melasma were studied: SSR and PQSNDY were significantly efficacious against all types of melasma, with slightly better results against epidermal melasma. In contrast, APEYL was significantly efficacious in dermal and mixed melasma, while in epidermal melasma the results were not statistically significant(99).

## **Discussion**

### **Systemic treatment**

Nowadays there are many systemic therapies that can be used as an adjuvant in melasma treatment. However, their efficacy in melasma has not been clearly demonstrated.

Oral PLE is one of the a valid options and it can be used as an adjuvant to topical treatment of melasma, especially in association with HQ cream. Further studies are necessary in order to assess the recurrence rates and the possibility of maintaining the systemic treatment with PLE

after topical treatment cessation, in order to avoid relapses. Dietary carotenoids, melatonin, either topical or systemic or both, as well as procyanidin + vitamins A, C E seem the least effective of the systemic treatments(18 20). However, additional studies following patients for longer periods might be useful. Oral TXA had better results than placebo, although not statistically significant(16,17). Oral TXA in combination with HQ 4% cream, as well as TC cream, rendered superior results than the topical treatment alone(23,25,29). In terms of delivery methods, oral TXA seems to have better results than microneedling(22). Additionally, in terms of TXA dosage, no significant differences were found between the use of either 500 mg, 750 mg, 1000 mg or 1500 mg daily(30).

### **Microneedling**

Microneedling is a minimally invasive, collagen induction therapy that consists in delivery of fine needles into the skin, either through needle rollers, stamping or electric-powered pens. It enhances transdermal drug delivery and has been used in dermatology for scar, striae and rhytides therapy(100).

Microneedling has been repeatedly proven to be an effective measure in melasma treatment, showing results even after as early as 7 days, from a histological viewpoint(32). Microneedling with TXA 0.4% rendered inferior results to GA peeling, silymarin cream(33), HQ 4% cream(37) and similar results to microneedling with vitamin C 40%(43). In the oral versus intradermal delivery of TXA, the former yielded superior results in an Indian cohort with majoritary mixed type of melasma(22), while the latter showed similar results between the two treatment groups, also in an Indian cohort, but this time with a predominant epidermal type of melasma(28) which might indicate that oral TXA is more efficacious against dermal and mixed melasma. The addition of glutathione to TXA cocktails used for microneedling procedures rendered superior results and zero recurrence rates.(35) In a study by Feng et al, microneedling with glutathione in combination with TXA was superior to HQ topical application(42). However, the full article was not accessible, therefore these results need further confirmation. Microneedling has also been used as combination therapy with HQ 4% cream, QSNYL and the results were superior to both topical and laser therapy alone.(39 41)

Tolerability is quite low, especially when dermapen is used, with adverse events varying from transient erythema, burning sensation, to pain, edema and ecchymosis(34). These local reactions are however, operator dependent.

## **Peeling**

Chemical peelings have been used for their ability to generate epidermal remodelling and can be classified as superficial, affecting the epidermis through the papillary dermis, medium, involving the papillary to the upper reticular dermis and deep, penetrating through the mid-reticular dermis.(101) However, in the treatment of melasma, the use of deep or medium-depth peelings is not encouraged in dark-skinned patients, because of the risk of hyperpigmentation.

epidermis-papillary dermis), medium-depth (papillary to upper reticular dermis) and deep subtypes based on the depth of their penetration (mid-reticular dermis).

In a meta-analysis by Dorgham et al, TCA and Jessner's solution were more efficacious than topical HQ in reducing the severity of melasma, while GA was better than TCA. Additionally, GA was similar to tretinoin, vitamin C iontophoresis, and amino fruit acid. Also, SA and LA were comparable to Jessner's solution in efficacy(102).

Most frequently used as combination therapy, chemical peelings had superior results in association with topical creams(45,50) rather than with microneedling(31) or laser(51).

## **Topical treatment**

Topical treatments have been the mainstay of melasma treatment. Photoprotection is the most important and it has been used as an adjuvant to other melasma treatments, since both UV and visible light can cause sustained hyperpigmentation in all skin types. Hydroquinone has been considered a first-line treatment for melasma and triple combination creams containing hydroquinone have become increasingly popular, as they yielded superior results. Kligman formula was the first TCC, containing HQ 5%, tretinoin 0.1% and dexamethasone 0.1%. The most recent TCC is Tri- Luma, which contains HQ 4%, tretinoin 0.05%, 0.1% fluocinolone acetonide and is FDA-

burning sensation, dryness, pruritus and scaling have been most frequently reported after topical HQ treatment(53,54,62,64,65).

Many other active ingredients have been studied, of which 1% flutamide(52) and thiamidol 0.2%(53) seem to have superior results to HQ, with no adverse events reported. TXA 5%(54,55,74), lignin peroxidase(58), petroselinum crispum solution(65), silymarin cream(68), 4% diacetyl boldine serum(69) and cosmetic product combination cream(57) had comparable results to HQ cream formulas, which make them a valid alternative to HQ. Furthermore, TXA combinations seem to be more efficacious against hypervascular, inflammatory melasma(61). Also, azelaic acid 10% combined with d-panthenol 10% had better results than other azelaic acid formulas(67).

### **Lasers and Light Therapy**

IPL therapy uses a flash lamp light source with wavelengths between 515 and 1200 nm and it selectively targets melanosomes, with the added advantage that it can simultaneously treat epidermal and dermal melasma(104). However, IPL effectiveness has not been convincingly demonstrated(77,80).

Among laser devices, QSNYL is the preferred choice for dermal and mixed types of melasma. Its two wavelengths, of 532 and 1064 nm, as well as a spot size of up to 10 mm allows for a deeper penetration of the laser beam and selective photothermolysis of melanosomes. This results in cell death, hyperinflammatory state and damage to the basement membrane, which determines exacerbation of melasma and relapse. This is why QSNYL is not recommended as first or second line treatment for melasma. It is, however, suggested that it can be used in recalcitrant cases, as a last resort, after other treatments have failed(105,106). On the other hand, LFQSNYL, also known as laser toning, uses a low-fluence, multi-pass technique, by which the cell membrane and nucleus remain intact, which results in melanocyte downregulation and hyperactive melanocyte cutoff(106). In a RCT by Kong et al, none of the patients in the LFQSNYL treatment group relapsed at week 16(89). Conversely, Vachiramon et al had 8 patients who relapsed after LFQSNYL treatment; they only included patients with mixed melasma(51).

A new class of lasers that generate picosecond- domain pulses, available in different wavelengths, of 532 nm, 755 nm and 1064 nm, determine melanin fragmentation by photoacoustic, rather than photothermal effect, thus determining even less inflammation than the LFQSNYL(104). Lee et al demonstrated picosecond 755 laser superiority to QSNYL(92).

Fractional resurfacing lasers, either ablative or non-ablative, creates different columns of microthermal damage in the skin, which determines lower inflammation and risk of dyspigmentation(104). Vanaman et al and Wanitphakdee et al demonstrate their efficacy in melasma(95,97).

As an antivascular treatment in melasma, PDL, QSNYL and IPL, either as monotherapy or combined with systemic or topical TXA, seems to be efficacious in cases of melasma with increased vascularity(107).

## **Conclusion**

PLE and TXA have been demonstrated to be an efficacious treatment, especially in association with topical HQ and TCC. Regarding tolerability, PLE is the safer option, while TXA has been linked to mild-to-moderate side effects.

Microneedling with a combination of TXA and glutathione has new and encouraging results that might prove superior to the gold standard so far, HQ cream and might also lower the recurrence rates. Additionally, oral TXA seems to have superior results to intradermal TXA in patients with dermal and mixed types of melasma. Further studies are needed to determine their effects, especially on the long term. Adverse events vary from mild to moderate and are operator dependent.

Chemical peelings have demonstrated high efficacy when combined with either topical or laser therapy. Used as monotherapy, TCA 20-25% with Jessner results. Transient adverse events are expected during and immediately after the peeling session. The use of deep and medium-depth peelings is highly discouraged in dark-skinned patients because the risk of hyperpigmentation.

Hydroquinone and triple combination creams containing HQ, like Kligman formula and Tri-Luma remain one of the best treatment options for melasma. Mild adverse events have been

associated with HQ application. TXA 5%, lignin peroxidase, petroselinum crispum solution, silymarin cream, and 4% diacetyl boldine serum seem to be an efficacious alternative to HQ products, with comparable results. Newer products, containing 1% flutamide or 0.2% thiamidol had encouraging results, with no adverse events reported and apparently superior to HQ.

A plethora of laser and light devices have become available in the last few years and many of them have been used in melasma treatment. Post-treatment hyperpigmentation and high recurrence rates associated with QSNYL led to the appearance of LFQSNYL and picosecond lasers, which determined less and less inflammation of the skin. Fractional and antivascular lasers have also proved their efficacy, the latter especially in cases of melasma with increased vascularity.

There is a lack of studies following melasma patients on the long term. Of course, as presented in the studies we have reviewed, the immediate results are impressive and statistically significant. However, in a few of the studies following patients for at least 2 months after the cessation of treatments applied, recurrence rates are as high as 100%, which is of great concern and requires immediate search for alternative therapeutic measures. Combination treatments have been proved time and again to be the best solution, either in double or triple combinations. Treatment

order to determinate the epidermal, dermal or mixed type of melasma, as well as the degree of vascularity.

## References

1. Zhou LL, Baibergenova A. Melasma: systematic review of the systemic treatments. *Int J Dermatol*. 2017 Sep;56(9):902–8.
2. Zhang Y, Zheng X, Chen Z, Lu L. Laser and laser compound therapy for melasma: a meta-analysis. *J Dermatol Treat*. 2020 Feb;31(1):77–83.
3. Ogbechie-Godec OA, Elbuluk N. Melasma: an Up-to-Date Comprehensive Review. *Dermatol Ther*. 2017 Sep;7(3):305–18.
4. G. M, C. K, S. S, Agrawal R. Melasma: Through the eye of a dermoscope. *Int J Res Dermatol*. 2016 Nov 18;2:113.
5. Kwon S-H, Hwang Y-J, Lee S-K, Park K-C. Heterogeneous Pathology of Melasma and Its Clinical Implications. *Int J Mol Sci*. 2016 May 26;17(6).
6. Sarkar R, Bansal A, Ailawadi P. Future therapies in melasma: What lies ahead? *Indian J Dermatol Venereol Leprol*. 2020 Feb;86(1):8–17.
7. Kwon S-H, Na J-I, Choi J-Y, Park K-C. Melasma: Updates and perspectives. *Exp Dermatol*. 2019 Jun;28(6):704–8.
8. Rodríguez-Arámbula A, Torres-Álvarez B, Cortés-García D, Fuentes-Ahumada C, Castanedo-Cázares JP. CD4, IL-17, and COX-2 Are Associated With Subclinical Inflammation in Malar Melasma. *Am J Dermatopathol*. 2015 Oct;37(10):761–6.
9. Campuzano-García AE, Torres-Alvarez B, Hernández-Blanco D, Fuentes-Ahumada C, Cortés-García JD, Castanedo-Cázares JP. DNA Methyltransferases in Malar Melasma and Their Modification by Sunscreen in Combination with 4% Niacinamide, 0.05% Retinoic Acid, or Placebo. *BioMed Res Int*. 2019;2019:9068314.
10. Yi J, Hong T, Zeng H, Li P, Li P, Wang S, et al. A Meta-analysis-Based Assessment of Intense Pulsed Light for Treatment of Melasma. *Aesthetic Plast Surg*. 2020 Jun;44(3):947–52.
11. Ikino JK/ N. Melasma and assessment of the quality of life in Brazilian women\*. *PubMed Cent*. 2015;196–200.
12. Rodrigues M, Pandya AG. Melasma: clinical diagnosis and management options. *Australas J Dermatol*. 2015 Aug;56(3):151–63.
13. Agamia N, Apalla Z, Salem W, Abdallah W. A comparative study between oral tranexamic acid versus oral tranexamic acid and Q-switched Nd-YAG laser in melasma treatment: a clinical and dermoscopic evaluation. *J Dermatol Treat*. 2020 Jan 7;1–8.
14. Ahmed AM, Lopez I, Perese F, Vasquez R, Hynan LS, Chong B, et al. A randomized, double-blinded, placebo-controlled trial of oral Polypodium leucotomos extract as an adjunct to sunscreen in the treatment of melasma. *JAMA Dermatol*. 2013 Aug;149(8):981–3.



15. Chuah SY/ T. Double-blind, Placebo-controlled Trial to Evaluate the Effectiveness of Polypodium Leucotomos Extract in the Treatment of Melasma in Asian Skin. PubMed Cent. 2018 Mar 1;14–9.
16. Colferai MMT, Miquelin GM, Steiner D. Evaluation of oral tranexamic acid in the treatment of melasma. J Cosmet Dermatol. 2018 Dec 9;
17. Del Rosario E, Florez-Pollack S, Zapata L, Hernandez K, Tovar-Garza A, Rodrigues M, et al. Randomized, placebo-controlled, double-blind study of oral tranexamic acid in the treatment of moderate-to-severe melasma. J Am Acad Dermatol. 2018 Feb;78(2):363–9.
18. Emily Gan WLT. Double Blind Placebo Controlled Trial to Evaluate of the Effectiveness of a Dietary Supplement Rich in Carotenoids as Adjunct to Topical Lightening Cream for the Treatment of Melasma: A Pilot Study. J Pigment Disord [Internet]. 2015 [cited 2021 Jan 8];02(02). Available from: <http://omicsgroup.org/journals/double-blind-placebo-controlled-trial-to-evaluate-of-the-effectiveness-of-a-dietary-supplement-rich-in-carotenoids-topical-lightening-cream-treatment-of-melasma-2376-0427.1000164.php?aid=40036>
19. Hamadi S, Aljaf A, Abdulrazak A, Mohammed M. The Role of Topical and Oral Melatonin in Management of Melasma Patients. J Arab Univ Basic Appl Sci. 2009 Jan 1;8:30–42.
20. Handog EB, Galang DAVF, de Leon-Godinez MA, Chan GP. A randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled trial of oral procyanidin with vitamins A, C, E for melasma among Filipino women. Int J Dermatol. 2009 Aug;48(8):896–901.
21. Karn D, Kc S, Amatya A, Razouria EA, Timalsina M. Oral tranexamic acid for the treatment of melasma. Kathmandu Univ Med J KUMJ. 2012 Dec;10(40):40–3.
22. Khurana VK, Misri RR, Agarwal S, Thole AV, Kumar S, Anand T. A randomized, open-label, comparative study of oral tranexamic acid and tranexamic acid microinjections in patients with melasma. Indian J Dermatol Venereol Leprol. 2019 Feb;85(1):39–43.
23. Lajevardi V, Ghayoumi A, Abedini R, Hosseini H, Goodarzi A, Akbari Z, et al. Comparison of the therapeutic efficacy and safety of combined oral tranexamic acid and topical hydroquinone 4% treatment vs. topical hydroquinone 4% alone in melasma: a parallel-group, assessor- and analyst-blinded, randomized controlled trial with a short-term follow-up. J Cosmet Dermatol. 2017 Jun;16(2):235–42.
24. martin lucy. A randomized double-blind placebo controlled study evaluating the effectiveness and tolerability of oral Polypodium leucotomos in patients with melasma. J Am Acad Dermatol. 2012 Apr;66(4):AB21.
25. Minni K, Poojary S. Efficacy and safety of oral tranexamic acid as an adjuvant in Indian patients with melasma: a prospective, interventional, single-centre, triple-blind, randomized, placebo-control, parallel group study. J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol JEADV. 2020 Nov;34(11):2636–44.
26. Padhi T/ P. Oral Tranexamic Acid with Fluocinolone-Based Triple Combination Cream Versus Fluocinolone-Based Triple Combination Cream Alone in Melasma: An Open Labeled Randomized Comparative Trial. PubMed Cent [Internet]. 2015; Available from: <https://www.pubmedcentral.nih.gov/articlerender.fcgi?tool=pmcentrez&artid=4601440>

27. Shin JU, Park J, Oh SH, Lee JH. Oral Tranexamic Acid Enhances the Efficacy of Low-Fluence 1064-Nm Quality-Switched Neodymium-Doped Yttrium Aluminum Garnet Laser Treatment for Melasma in Koreans: A Randomized, Prospective Trial: *Dermatol Surg*. 2013 Mar;39(3pt1):435–42.
28. Sharma R, Mahajan VK, Mehta KS, Chauhan PS, Rawat R, Shiny TN. Therapeutic efficacy and safety of oral tranexamic acid and that of tranexamic acid local infiltration with microinjections in patients with melasma: a comparative study. *Clin Exp Dermatol*. 2017 Oct;42(7):728–34.
29. Shihab N, Prihartono J, Tovar-Garza A, Agustin T, Legiawati L, Pandya AG. Randomised, controlled, double-blind study of combination therapy of oral tranexamic acid and topical hydroquinone in the treatment of melasma. *Australas J Dermatol*. 2020 Aug;61(3):237–42.
30. Zhu C-Y, Li Y, Sun Q-N, Takada A, Kawada A. Analysis of the effect of different doses of oral tranexamic acid on melasma: a multicentre prospective study. *Eur J Dermatol EJD*. 2019 Feb 1;29(1):55–8.
31. Balevi A, Ustuner P, Özdemir M. Salicylic acid peeling combined with vitamin C mesotherapy versus salicylic acid peeling alone in the treatment of mixed type melasma: A comparative study. *J Cosmet Laser Ther Off Publ Eur Soc Laser Dermatol*. 2017 Oct;19(5):294–9.
32. Cassiano DP, Espósito ACC, Hassun KM, Lima EV de A, Bagatin E, Miot HA. Early clinical and histological changes induced by microneedling in facial melasma: A pilot study. *Indian J Dermatol Venereol Leprol*. 2019 Dec;85(6):638–41.
33. Elfar NN. Efficacy of Intradermal Injection of Tranexamic Acid, Topical Silymarin and Glycolic Acid Peeling in Treatment of Melasma: A Comparative Study. *J Clin Exp Dermatol Res [Internet]*. 2015 [cited 2021 Jan 8];06(03). Available from: <https://www.omicsonline.org/open-access/efficacy-of-intradermal-injection-of-tranexamic-acid-topical-silymarin-and-glycolic-acid-peeling-in-treatment-of-melasma-a-comparative-study-2155-9554-1000280.php?aid=57839>
34. Hofny ERM, Abdel-Motaleb AA, Ghazally A, Ahmed AM, Hussein MRA. Platelet-rich plasma is a useful therapeutic option in melasma. *J Dermatol Treat*. 2019 Jun;30(4):396–401.
35. Iraj F, Nasimi M, Asilian A, Faghihi G, Mozafarpour S, Hafezi H. Efficacy of mesotherapy with tranexamic acid and ascorbic acid with and without glutathione in treatment of melasma: A split face comparative trial. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2019 Feb 8;
36. Kaleem S/ G. Comparison of efficacy of Tranexamic Acid Mesotherapy versus 0.9% normal Saline for Melasma; A split face study in a Tertiary Care Hospital of Karachi. *PubMed Cent*. 2020;930–4.
37. Pazyar N/ Y. Comparison of the efficacy of intradermal injected tranexamic acid vs hydroquinone cream in the treatment of melasma. *PubMed Cent*. 2019 Feb 14;115–22.
38. Saki N, Darayesh M, Heiran A. Comparing the efficacy of topical hydroquinone 2% versus intradermal tranexamic acid microinjections in treating melasma: a split-face controlled trial. *J Dermatol Treat*. 2018 Jun;29(4):405–10.

39. Tehranchinia Z, Saghi B, Rahimi H. Evaluation of Therapeutic Efficacy and Safety of Tranexamic Acid Local Infiltration in Combination with Topical 4% Hydroquinone Cream Compared to Topical 4% Hydroquinone Cream Alone in Patients with Melasma: A Split-Face Study. *Dermatol Res Pract*. 2018;2018:8350317.
40. Ustuner P, Balevi A, Ozdemir M. A split-face, investigator-blinded comparative study on the efficacy and safety of Q-switched Nd:YAG laser plus microneedling with vitamin C versus Q-switched Nd:YAG laser for the treatment of recalcitrant melasma. *J Cosmet Laser Ther Off Publ Eur Soc Laser Dermatol*. 2017 Nov;19(7):383–90.
41. Xu Y, Ma R, Juliandri J, Wang X, Xu B, Wang D, et al. Efficacy of functional microarray of microneedles combined with topical tranexamic acid for melasma: A randomized, self-controlled, split-face study. *Medicine (Baltimore)*. 2017 May;96(19):e6897.
42. Feng C, Yan M. Clinical observation on tranexamic acid combined with reduced glutathione for the treatment of chloasma. *Pak J Pharm Sci*. 2018 Nov;31(6(Special)):2823–6.
43. Zhao H, Li M, Zhang X, Li L, Yan Y, Wang B. Comparing the efficacy of Myjet-assisted tranexamic acid and vitamin C in treating melasma: A split-face controlled trial. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2020 Jan;19(1):47–54.
44. Abdel-Meguid AM, Taha EA, Ismail SA. Combined Jessner Solution and Trichloroacetic Acid Versus Trichloroacetic Acid Alone in the Treatment of Melasma in Dark-Skinned Patients. *Dermatol Surg Off Publ Am Soc Dermatol Surg Al*. 2017 May;43(5):651–6.
45. Dayal S, Sahu P, Dua R. Combination of glycolic acid peel and topical 20% azelaic acid cream in melasma patients: efficacy and improvement in quality of life. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2017 Mar;16(1):35–42.
46. Faghihi G/ T. Solution of Azelaic Acid (20%), Resorcinol (10%) and Phytic Acid (6%) Versus Glycolic Acid (50%) Peeling Agent in the Treatment of Female Patients with Facial Melasma. *PubMed Cent [Internet]*. 2017 Feb 22; Available from: <https://www.pubmedcentral.nih.gov/articlerender.fcgi?tool=pmcentrez&artid=5343614>
47. Garg S, Thami GP, Bhalla M, Kaur J, Kumar A. Comparative Efficacy of a 35% Glycolic Acid Peel Alone or in Combination With a 10% and 20% Trichloroacetic Acid Spot Peel for Melasma: A Randomized Control Trial. *Dermatol Surg Off Publ Am Soc Dermatol Surg Al*. 2019 Nov;45(11):1394–400.
48. Mahajan R/ K. Glycolic Acid Peels/Azelaic Acid 20% Cream Combination and Low Potency Triple Combination Lead to Similar Reduction in Melasma Severity in Ethnic Skin: Results of a Randomized Controlled Study. *PubMed Cent*. 2015;147–52.
49. Murtaza F, Bangash AR, Khushdil A, Noor SM. Efficacy of Trichloro-Acetic Acid Peel Alone Versus Combined Topical Magnesium Ascorbyl Phosphate for Epidermal Melasma. *J Coll Physicians Surg-Pak JCPSP*. 2016 Jul;26(7):557–61.
50. Sahu P/ Y. Clinical Efficacy and Safety on Combining 20% Trichloroacetic Acid Peel with Topical 5% Ascorbic Acid for Melasma. *PubMed Cent*. 2017 Sep 1;WC08-WC11.

51. Vachiramon V, Sahawatwong S, Sirithanabadeekul P. Treatment of melasma in men with low-fluence Q-switched neodymium-doped yttrium-aluminum-garnet laser versus combined laser and glycolic acid peeling. *Dermatol Surg Off Publ Am Soc Dermatol Surg Al*. 2015 Apr;41(4):457–65.
52. Adalatkah H, Sadeghi-Bazargani H. The first clinical experience on efficacy of topical flutamide on melasma compared with topical hydroquinone: a randomized clinical trial. *Drug Des Devel Ther*. 2015;9:4219–25.
53. Arrowitz C, Schoelermann AM, Mann T, Jiang LI, Weber T, Kolbe L. Effective Tyrosinase Inhibition by Thiamidol Results in Significant Improvement of Mild to Moderate Melasma. *J Invest Dermatol*. 2019 Aug;139(8):1691-1698.e6.
54. Atefi N/ G. Therapeutic Effects of Topical Tranexamic Acid in Comparison with Hydroquinone in Treatment of Women with Melasma. *PubMed Cent*. 2017 Jul 26;417–24.
55. Banihashemi M, Zabolinejad N, Jaafari MR, Salehi M, Jabari A. Comparison of therapeutic effects of liposomal Tranexamic Acid and conventional Hydroquinone on melasma. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2015 Sep;14(3):174–7.
56. Boukari F, Jourdan E, Fontas E, Montaudie H, Castela E, Lacour J-P, et al. Prevention of melasma relapses with sunscreen combining protection against UV and short wavelengths of visible light: a prospective randomized comparative trial. *J Am Acad Dermatol*. 2015 Jan;72(1):189-190.e1.
57. Bronzina E/ C. Efficacy and tolerability on melasma of a topical cosmetic product acting on melanocytes, fibroblasts and endothelial cells: a randomized comparative trial against 4% hydroquinone. *PubMed Cent*. 2020 Jan 12;897–903.
58. Draelos ZD. A split-face evaluation of a novel pigment-lightening agent compared with no treatment and hydroquinone. *J Am Acad Dermatol*. 2015 Jan;72(1):105–7.
59. Eshghi G, Khezrian L, Esna Ashari F. Comparison between Intralesional Triamcinolone and Kligman's Formula in Treatment of Melasma. *Acta Med Iran*. 2016 Jan;54(1):67–71.
60. Farshi S, Mansouri P, Kasraee B. Efficacy of cysteamine cream in the treatment of epidermal melasma, evaluating by Dermacatch as a new measurement method: a randomized double blind placebo controlled study. *J Dermatol Treat*. 2018 Mar;29(2):182–9.
61. Fioranelli M, Jafferany M, Wollina U, Tirant M, Thuong NV, Lotti T. New local treatments for different types of melasma: Vascular type vs nonvascular type. A randomized polycentric study. *Dermatol Ther*. 2020;33(3):e13300.
62. Gheisari M, Dadkhahfar S, Olamaei E, Moghimi HR, Niknejad N, Najari Nobari N. The efficacy and safety of topical 5% methimazole vs 4% hydroquinone in the treatment of melasma: A randomized controlled trial. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2020 Jan;19(1):167–72.
63. Gong Z, Lai W, Zhao G, Wang X, Zheng M, Li L, et al. Efficacy and safety of fluocinolone acetonide, hydroquinone, and tretinoin cream in chinese patients with melasma: a randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled, multicenter, parallel-group study. *Clin Drug Investig*. 2015 Jun;35(6):385–95.

64. Ibrahim ZA, Gheida SF, El Maghraby GM, Farag ZE. Evaluation of the efficacy and safety of combinations of hydroquinone, glycolic acid, and hyaluronic acid in the treatment of melasma. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2015 Jun;14(2):113–23.
65. Khosravan S, Alami A, Mohammadzadeh-Moghadam H, Ramezani V. The Effect of Topical Use of *Petroselinum Crispum* (Parsley) Versus That of Hydroquinone Cream on Reduction of Epidermal Melasma: A Randomized Clinical Trial. *Holist Nurs Pract*. 2017 Feb;31(1):16–20.
66. Mansouri P, Farshi S, Hashemi Z, Kasraee B. Evaluation of the efficacy of cysteamine 5% cream in the treatment of epidermal melasma: a randomized double-blind placebo-controlled trial. *Br J Dermatol*. 2015 Jul;173(1):209–17.
67. Mazurek K, Pierzchała E. Comparison of efficacy of products containing azelaic acid in melasma treatment. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2016 Sep;15(3):269–82.
68. Nofal A, Ibrahim A-SM, Nofal E, Gamal N, Osman S. Topical silymarin versus hydroquinone in the treatment of melasma: A comparative study. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2019 Feb;18(1):263–70.
69. Pratchyapurit W-O. Combined use of two formulations containing diacetyl boldine, TGF- $\beta$ 1 biomimetic oligopeptide-68 with other hypopigmenting/exfoliating agents and sunscreen provides effective and convenient treatment for facial melasma. Either is equal to or is better than 4% hydroquinone on normal skin. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2016 Jun;15(2):131–44.
70. Shamsi Meymandi S, Mohammadzadeh Shanehsaz S, Ansari Dogaheh M, Jahani Y. Efficacy of licorice extract in the treatment of melasma: A randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled clinical trial. *J Dermatol Cosmet*. 2016 Apr 10;7(1):1–9.
71. Taghavi F, Banihashemi M, Zabolinejad N, Salehi M, Jaafari MR, Marhamati H, et al. Comparison of therapeutic effects of conventional and liposomal form of 4% topical hydroquinone in patients with melasma. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2019 Jun;18(3):870–3.
72. Vachiramon V, Iamsumang W, Chanasumon N, Thadanipon K, Triyangkulsri K. A study of efficacy and safety of high-intensity focused ultrasound for the treatment of melasma in Asians: A single-blinded, randomized, split-face, pilot study. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2020 Feb;19(2):375–81.
73. Zhang Q, Tu Y, Gu H, Sun D, Wu W, Man M-Q, et al. A cream of herbal mixture to improve melasma. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2019 Dec;18(6):1721–8.
74. Janney MS/ S. A Randomized Controlled Study Comparing the Efficacy of Topical 5% Tranexamic Acid Solution versus 3% Hydroquinone Cream in Melasma. *PubMed Cent*. 2019;63–7.
75. Bae MI, Park JM, Jeong KH, Lee MH, Shin MK. Effectiveness of low-fluence and short-pulse intense pulsed light in the treatment of melasma: A randomized study. *J Cosmet Laser Ther Off Publ Eur Soc Laser Dermatol*. 2015;17(6):292–5.
76. Daniel Barolet. Dual Effect of Photobiomodulation on Melasma. *PubMed Cent*. 2018 Apr 1;28–34.
77. Chung JY, Lee JH, Lee JH. Topical tranexamic acid as an adjuvant treatment in melasma: Side-by-side comparison clinical study. *J Dermatol Treat*. 2016 Aug;27(4):373–7.

78. Hassan AM, Elfar NN, Rizk OM, Eissa NY. Pulsed dye laser versus intense pulsed light in melasma: a split-face comparative study. *J Dermatol Treat*. 2018 Nov;29(7):725–32.
79. Shakeeb N, Noor SM, Ullah G, Paracha MM. Efficacy of Intense Pulse Light Therapy and Tripple Combination Cream Versus Intense Pulse Light Therapy and Tripple Combination Cream Alone in Epidermal Melasma Treatment. *J Coll Physicians Surg--Pak JCPSP*. 2018 Jan;28(1):13–6.
80. Yun WJ, Lee SM, Han JS, Lee SH, Chang SY, Haw S, et al. A prospective, split-face, randomized study of the efficacy and safety of a novel fractionated intense pulsed light treatment for melasma in Asians. *J Cosmet Laser Ther Off Publ Eur Soc Laser Dermatol*. 2015;17(5):259–66.
81. Abdel-Raouf Mohamed H, Ali Nasif G, Saad Abdel-Azim E, Abd El-Fatah Ahmed M. Comparative study of fractional Erbium: YAG laser vs combined therapy with topical steroid as an adjuvant treatment in melasma. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2019 Apr;18(2):517–23.
82. Alavi S/ A. Combination of Q-Switched Nd:YAG and Fractional Erbium:YAG Lasers in Treatment of Melasma: A Randomized Controlled Clinical Trial. *PubMed Cent*. 2017 Jan 8;1–6.
83. Badawi AM/ O. Fractional erbium-doped yttrium aluminum garnet laser-assisted drug delivery of hydroquinone in the treatment of melasma. *PubMed Cent*. 2018 Jan 3;13–20.
84. Chalermchai T, Rummaneethorn P. Effects of a fractional picosecond 1,064 nm laser for the treatment of dermal and mixed type melasma. *J Cosmet Laser Ther Off Publ Eur Soc Laser Dermatol*. 2018 Jun;20(3):134–9.
85. Choi Y-J, Nam J-H, Kim JY, Min JH, Park KY, Ko EJ, et al. Efficacy and safety of a novel picosecond laser using combination of 1 064 and 595 nm on patients with melasma: A prospective, randomized, multicenter, split-face, 2% hydroquinone cream-controlled clinical trial. *Lasers Surg Med*. 2017 Dec;49(10):899–907.
86. Choi CP, Yim SM, Seo SH, Ahn HH, Kye YC, Choi JE. Retrospective analysis of melasma treatment using a dual mode of low-fluence Q-switched and long-pulse Nd:YAG laser vs. low-fluence Q-switched Nd:YAG laser monotherapy. *J Cosmet Laser Ther Off Publ Eur Soc Laser Dermatol*. 2015 Feb;17(1):2–8.
87. Guo X/ C. Q-PTP is an optimized technology of 1064-nm Q-switched neodymium-doped yttrium aluminum garnet laser in the laser therapy of melasma: A prospective split-face study. *PubMed Cent*. 2019 Aug 14;4136–43.
88. Hammami Ghorbel H, Boukari F, Fontas E, Montaudié H, Bahadoran P, Lacour J-P, et al. Copper Bromide Laser vs Triple-Combination Cream for the Treatment of Melasma: A Randomized Clinical Trial. *JAMA Dermatol*. 2015 Jul;151(7):791–2.
89. Kong SH/ S. Treatment of Melasma with Pulsed-Dye Laser and 1,064-nm Q-Switched Nd:YAG Laser: A Split-Face Study. *PubMed Cent*. 2017 Dec 26;1–7.
90. Laothaworn V, Juntongjin P. Topical 3% tranexamic acid enhances the efficacy of 1064-nm Q-switched neodymium-doped yttrium aluminum garnet laser in the treatment of melasma. *J Cosmet Laser Ther Off Publ Eur Soc Laser Dermatol*. 2018 Oct;20(6):320–5.

91. Lee M-C, Chang C-S, Huang Y-L, Chang S-L, Chang C-H, Lin Y-F, et al. Treatment of melasma with mixed parameters of 1,064-nm Q-switched Nd:YAG laser toning and an enhanced effect of ultrasonic application of vitamin C: a split-face study. *Lasers Med Sci.* 2015 Jan;30(1):159–63.
92. Lee M-C, Lin Y-F, Hu S, Huang Y-L, Chang S-L, Cheng C-Y, et al. A split-face study: comparison of picosecond alexandrite laser and Q-switched Nd:YAG laser in the treatment of melasma in Asians. *Lasers Med Sci.* 2018 Nov;33(8):1733–8.
93. Nourmohammadi Abadchi S/ FN. Combination of Hydroquinone and Fractional CO2 Laser versus Hydroquinone Monotherapy in Melasma Treatment: A Randomized, Single-blinded, Split-face Clinical Trial. *PubMed Cent.* 2019;129–35.
94. Tawfic SO, Abdel Halim DM, Albarbary A, Abdelhady M. Assessment of combined fractional CO2 and tranexamic acid in melasma treatment. *Lasers Surg Med.* 2019 Jan;51(1):27–33.
95. Vanaman Wilson MJ, Jones IT, Bolton J, Larsen L, Fabi SG. The Safety and Efficacy of Treatment With a 1,927-nm Diode Laser With and Without Topical Hydroquinone for Facial Hyperpigmentation and Melasma in Darker Skin Types. *Dermatol Surg Off Publ Am Soc Dermatol Surg Al.* 2018 Oct;44(10):1304–10.
96. Wang Y-J, Lin E-T, Chen Y-T, Chiu P-C, Lin B-S, Chiang H-M, et al. Prospective randomized controlled trial comparing treatment efficacy and tolerance of picosecond alexandrite laser with a diffractive lens array and triple combination cream in female asian patients with melasma. *J Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol JEADV.* 2020 Mar;34(3):624–32.
97. Wanitphakdeedecha R, Sy-Alvarado F, Patthamalai P, Techapichetvanich T, Eimpunth S, Manuskiatti W. The efficacy in treatment of facial melasma with thulium 1927-nm fractional laser-assisted topical tranexamic acid delivery: a split-face, double-blind, randomized controlled pilot study. *Lasers Med Sci.* 2020 Dec;35(9):2015–21.
98. Sarma N/ C. Evidence-based Review, Grade of Recommendation, and Suggested Treatment Recommendations for Melasma. *PubMed Cent.* 2017;406–42.
99. Garg S, Vashisht KR, Makadia S. A prospective randomized comparative study on 60 Indian patients of melasma, comparing pixel Q-switched NdYAG (1064 nm), super skin rejuvenation (540 nm) and ablative pixel erbium YAG (2940 nm) lasers, with a review of the literature. *J Cosmet Laser Ther Off Publ Eur Soc Laser Dermatol.* 2019 Aug;21(5):297–307.
100. Wu SZ, Muddasani S, Alam M. A Systematic Review of the Efficacy and Safety of Microneedling in the Treatment of Melasma. *Dermatol Surg Off Publ Am Soc Dermatol Surg Al.* 2020 Dec;46(12):1636–41.
101. Conforti C, Zalaudek I, Vezzoni R, Retrosi C, Fai A, Fadda S, et al. Chemical peeling for acne and melasma: current knowledge and innovations. *G Ital Dermatol E Venereol Organo Uff Soc Ital Dermatol E Sifilogr.* 2020 Jun;155(3):280–5.
102. Dorgham NA, Hegazy RA, Sharobim AK, Dorgham DA. Efficacy and tolerability of chemical peeling as a single agent for melasma in dark-skinned patients: A systematic review and meta-analysis of comparative trials. *J Cosmet Dermatol.* 2020 Nov;19(11):2812–9.

103. Spierings NMK. Melasma: A critical analysis of clinical trials investigating treatment modalities published in the past 10 years. *J Cosmet Dermatol*. 2020 Jun;19(6):1284–9.
104. Trivedi MK, Yang FC, Cho BK. A review of laser and light therapy in melasma. *Int J Womens Dermatol*. 2017 Mar;3(1):11–20.
105. Aurangabadkar SJ. Optimizing Q-switched lasers for melasma and acquired dermal melanoses. *Indian J Dermatol Venereol Leprol*. 2019 Feb;85(1):10–7.
106. Shah SD/ A. Laser Toning in Melasma. *PubMed Cent*. 2019;76–84.
107. Masub N, Nguyen JK, Austin E, Jagdeo J. The Vascular Component of Melasma: A Systematic Review of Laboratory, Diagnostic, and Therapeutic Evidence. *Dermatol Surg Off Publ Am Soc Dermatol Surg Al*. 2020 Dec;46(12):1642–50.

## **Table legends**

Table 1. Melasma treatment and mechanism of action.

Table 2. Systemic treatments.

Table 3. Microneedling.

Table 4. Peeling.

Table 5. Topical treatments.

Table 6. Laser and light treatments.



**Table 1. Melasma treatment and mechanism of action.**

| MELANOGENESIS AND MELANOSOMAL TRANSFER TO KERATINOCYTES | EXCESS REACTIVE OXYGEN SPECIES AND INFLAMMATION |
|---------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| aloesin                                                 | acidified amino acid peels                      |
| alpha lipoic acid                                       | alpha tocopherol                                |
| antisense oligonucleotides                              | carotenoid                                      |
| arbutin                                                 | coffeeberry extract                             |
| ascorbic acid                                           | curcumin                                        |
| azelaic acid                                            | epigallocatechin-3-gallate                      |
| cinnamic acid                                           | glutathione                                     |
| dimethyl hydroxy furanone                               | hesperidin                                      |
| ellagic acid                                            |                                                 |

**Table 2. Systemic treatments.**

| Reference             | Year | Patients: nr, ethnicity | Comparison      | Treatment A                                            | Treatment B                                                | Treat. Duration                                     | Melasma Type                   | Efficacy/ Outcomes                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Tolerability/ Adverse Events                                                                                                                                  | Recurrence rates                                                                                      |
|-----------------------|------|-------------------------|-----------------|--------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Agamia et al(13)      | 2020 | 60, Egyptian            | single double x | oral TXA 250 mg                                        | oral TXA 250 mg + Qs-Nd: YAG laser (1064 nm)               | oral TXA 250 mg daily, laser biweekly, for 3 months | 10 epidermal 4 dermal 46 mixed | Significant decrease in mMASI score at 6 months in both groups, with group B showing a significantly better response than A.                                                                                                     | Gastrointestinal upset, change in menstrual periods in both groups. Long-standing erythema, itching/discomfort and punctate leukoderma after laser treatment. | 3 in group A, 4 in group B.                                                                           |
| Ahmed et al(14)       | 2013 | 33, Hispanic            | single single x | PLE 240 mg                                             | Placebo                                                    | three times daily, for 12 weeks                     | N/A                            | Significant decrease in MI and MASI scores in both groups.                                                                                                                                                                       | No serious adverse events.                                                                                                                                    | N/A                                                                                                   |
| Chuah et al(15)       | 2018 | 40, Asian               | single double x | 4% hydroquinone cream + oral PLE                       | 4% hydroquinone cream                                      | daily, for 12 weeks                                 | N/A                            | Significant decrease in mMASI scores in both groups at weeks 4, 8, 12. mMASI score in group A at week 8, 12 was significantly lower than in group B, but at day 84 there were no significant differences between the two groups. | Mild itching and stinging sensation in both groups.                                                                                                           | N/A                                                                                                   |
| Colferai et al(16)    | 2018 | 37, Brazilian           | single double x | oral TXA 250 mg                                        | oral placebo                                               | oral TXA 250 mg twice daily, for 12 weeks           | N/A                            | Significant decrease in MASI, MELASQoL and colorimetry scores in group A and in MELASQoL score in group B at week 12.                                                                                                            | Gastrointestinal symptoms, change in menstrual flow, headache in group A.                                                                                     | N/A                                                                                                   |
| Del Rosario et al(17) | 2018 | 39, Americans           | single double x | oral TXA 250 mg                                        | oral placebo                                               | oral TXA 250 mg twice daily, for 3 months           | N/A                            | 49% reduction in mMASI score in group A vs. 18% in group B at month 3. 26% reduction in mMASI in group A Vs. 19% reduction in group B at month 6.                                                                                | Gastrointestinal symptoms, change in menstrual flow, headache, myalgias in both groups, somnolence, arthralgias, blurry vision in group A.                    | Increase in mMASI scores from week 12 to 24 in both groups, with final values lower than at baseline. |
| Gan et al(18)         | 2015 | 44, Asian               | single double x | oral dietary carotenoids 800 mg + lightening cream     | oral placebo + lightening cream                            | once daily, for 84 days                             | N/A                            | Significant decrease in median mMASI score in both groups, with no significant difference between the groups. Significant improvement in erythema scores in both groups, with significantly better scores in group A.            | Stinging, burning, pruritus in both groups.                                                                                                                   | N/A                                                                                                   |
| Hamadi et al(19)      | 2010 | 46, Iranians            | single double s | A: topical melatonin; B: topical melatonin + sunscreen | C: oral melatonin, 3 mg + topical melatonin D: HQ 4% cream | daily, for 90 days                                  | N/A                            | Significant decrease in MASI scores in all groups.                                                                                                                                                                               | Mild, transient drowsiness.                                                                                                                                   | N/A                                                                                                   |
| Handog et al(20)      | 2009 | 56, Filipino            | single single x | Oral procyanidin 24 mg + vitamins                      | Placebo                                                    | twice daily, for 8 weeks                            | 56 epidermal                   | Significant decrease in MASI scores in both groups.                                                                                                                                                                              | Metallic taste, reversible on discontinuation in group A.                                                                                                     | N/A                                                                                                   |

|                     |      |                    |                    |                                                                                                    |                       |                                                                                |                                           |                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                |
|---------------------|------|--------------------|--------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                     |      |                    |                    | A+C+E:<br>6 mg<br>b-carotene, 60<br>mg ascorbic<br>acid, 15 IU of<br>D-α-<br>tocopherol<br>acetate |                       |                                                                                |                                           |                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                |
| Karn et al(21)      | 2012 | 260, Nepalese      | single x<br>double | TXA 250 mg<br>+ HQ cream                                                                           | Placebo +<br>HQ cream | twice<br>daily, for<br>12 weeks                                                | 173<br>epidermal<br>28 dermal<br>59 mixed | Significant decrease of<br>the MASI scores in<br>group A at weeks 8<br>and 12 and in group B<br>at week 8.                                    | Group A:<br>oligomenorrhea,<br>belching,<br>abdominal<br>cramps,<br>palpitation,<br>urticarial rash<br>with angioedema.<br>Group B:<br>exogenous<br>ochronosis. | N/A                                                                            |
| Khurana et al(22)   | 2019 | 64, Indian         | single x<br>single | microneedling<br>with TXA<br>0.4%                                                                  | oral TXA<br>250 mg    | A:<br>monthly,<br>B: twice<br>daily, for<br>3 months                           | 17 epidermal<br>3 dermal<br>44 mixed      | Significant decrease in<br>MASI score in group<br>B as compared to A.                                                                         | Group A: mild<br>pain and<br>erythema. Group<br>B: gastritis,<br>oligomenorrhea.                                                                                | 3 patients<br>in group A<br>and 2 in<br>group B at<br>6 months                 |
| Lajevardi et al(23) | 2017 | 88, Iranian        | single x<br>double | oral TXA 250<br>mg + HQ 4%<br>cream                                                                | HQ cream 4%           | TXA 250<br>mg three<br>times<br>daily,<br>cream<br>nightly,<br>for 3<br>months | N/A                                       | Significant decrease in<br>mean MASI score in<br>group A compared to<br>B. Significantly higher<br>patient satisfaction in<br>group A than B. | Severe abdominal<br>pain, flank pain,<br>edema of the<br>hands and feet,<br>nausea, vomiting,<br>and headache in<br>group A.                                    | Relapse<br>rate of<br>30% and<br>26%, in<br>groups A<br>and B, at 6<br>months. |
| Martin et al(24)    | 2012 | 21,<br>multiracial | single x<br>single | PLE                                                                                                | Placebo               | twice<br>daily, for<br>12 weeks                                                | N/A                                       | Significant decrease of<br>MASI and<br>MELASQoL scores<br>in group A as<br>compared to B.                                                     | No serious<br>adverse events.                                                                                                                                   | N/A                                                                            |

|             |    |      |            |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |                               |
|-------------|----|------|------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|-------------------------------|
| Shin al(27) | et | 2013 | 48, Korean |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | although lower than baseline. |
|-------------|----|------|------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|-------------------------------|

**Table 3. Microneedling.**

| Reference          | Year | Patients: nr, ethnicity | Comparison      | Treatment A                                                          | Treatment B                                                       | Treatment C    | Treatment Duration                                        | Melasma Type                    | Efficacy/ Outcomes                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Tolerability/ Adverse Events                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Recurrence rates       |
|--------------------|------|-------------------------|-----------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|
| Balevi et al(31)   | 2017 | 41, Turkish             | single x double | 30 % SA peel                                                         | 30 % SA peel + microneedling (mesoneedles) with vitamin C         | N/A            | A,B: every 2 weeks for 2 months                           | 41 mixed                        | MASI scores significantly decreased in both groups, but with no significant difference between them. Significant decrease in MelasQoL scores in Group A compared to Group B.                                                            | Mild to moderate burning sensation in Group B during injections.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | N/A                    |
| Cassiano et al(32) | 2019 | 20, Brazilian           | single x double | microneedling (Dermaroller 1.5 mm) + SPF 50 sunscreen                | SPF 50 sunscreen                                                  | N/A            | for 7 days                                                | N/A                             | mMASI, colorimetry, and quality of life parameters improved only in group A. Histologic assessment: significant reduction in melanin density, pendulous melanocytes and basement membrane damage per histological field.                | N/A                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | N/A                    |
| Elfar et al(33)    | 2015 | 60, Egyptian            | single x single | microneedling with 0.4% TXA                                          | Topical Silymarin cream 14 mg/ ml                                 | 50% GA peeling | A: weekly; B: twice daily; C: every 2 weeks, for 12 weeks | 30 epidermal 13 dermal 17 mixed | Statistically significant difference with the best results in mMASI scores in group C>B >A. There was statistically significant difference between A<B, A<C, group A showing weaker response than B and C.                              | Group A: burning pain and wheal at the site of injection, erythema. Group B: no side effects. Group C: post inflammatory hyperpigmentation. Significant differences between group A and groups B and C, groups B and C being the safest; also between group B and C where group B was the safest. | N/A                    |
| Feng et al(42)     | 2018 | 180, Chinese            | single x double | microneedling with tranexamic acid + reduced glutathione             | topical hydroquinone cream                                        | N/A            | N/A                                                       | N/A                             | Significantly higher efficacy in group A than B.                                                                                                                                                                                        | N/A                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | N/A                    |
| Hofny et al(34)    | 2019 | 23, Egyptian            | double x double | microneedling 2 mm with dermapen + PRP on the right side of the face | microneedling with mesoneedles + PRP on the left side of the face | N/A            | monthly, 3 sessions                                       | 18 epidermal 5 mixed            | MASI and mMASI scores decreased significantly. A statistically significant decrease was noted in the hemi-MASI score on each side of the face following PRP treatment, but there was no significant difference on comparing both sides. | The majority of the patients experienced more pain with mesoneedles than with dermapen. All the patients observed less downtime with mesoneedles than with dermapen.                                                                                                                              | N/A                    |
| Iraji et al(35)    | 2019 | 30, Iranian             | double x double | microneedling (mesoneedles) with TXA 0.4% + vitamin C                | microneedling (mesoneedles) with TXA 0.4% + vitamin C             | N/A            | every 2 weeks, 6 sessions                                 | 6 epidermal 5 dermal 19 mixed   | Significantly more reduction of mMASI score with cocktail A than B at week 12. Patient satisfaction was significantly higher for cocktail A than B.                                                                                     | Erythema, edema and ecchymosis.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | no relapses at week 24 |

|                        |      |               |                 |                                                                                                              |                                                                                                           |     |                                                                              |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                   |                                                   |
|------------------------|------|---------------|-----------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|
|                        |      |               |                 | 3% + glutathione 2% on the right half of the face                                                            | 3% on the left half of the face                                                                           |     |                                                                              |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                   |                                                   |
| Kaleem et al(36)       | 2020 | 60, Pakistani | single x double | microneedling with TXA 0.4% on the left side of the face                                                     | microneedling with saline 0.9% on the right side of the face                                              | N/A | every 2 weeks for 12 weeks                                                   | 20 epidermal 33 dermal 7 mixed | Mean of H-mMASI score showed significant reduction in group A compared to group B.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Erythema, swelling, and burning were documented as temporary side effects on both sides.                                          | N/A                                               |
| Pazyar et al(37)       | 2019 | 41, Iranian   | double x double | microneedling with TXA 0.4% on the right side of the face + topical 4% HQ cream on the left side of the face | microneedling with TXA 1% on the right side of the face; topical 4% HQ cream on the left side of the face | N/A | microneedling: every 2 weeks, cream: twice daily, for 12 weeks               | 26 epidermal 1 dermal 14 mixed | Significant decrease in MASI score for group A, group B, and HQ cream at week 12 with no significant difference between groups A and B. Significantly better results in the HQ group than 0.4% TXA group at weeks 8 and 12. Higher patient satisfaction rates in group A>B and in HQ>A, but not statistically significant. | All patients experienced injection site burning pain, one patient reported urticaria. No adverse effect was seen in the HQ group. | 6 patients in group A and 2 in Group B at week 24 |
| Saki et al(38)         | 2018 | 37, Iranian   | single x single | hydroquinone 2% cream                                                                                        | microneedling with TXA 0.4 %                                                                              | N/A | cream nightly for 3 months; monthly microneedling sessions, 3 in total       | 13 epidermal 6 dermal 12 mixed | Colorimetry measurements for melanin value: significant reduction in both groups, with significantly better results in group B than A at week 4, but not at week 20. Significantly better patient satisfaction rates in group B than A.                                                                                    | N/A                                                                                                                               | N/A                                               |
| Tehranchinia et al(39) | 2018 | 55, Iranian   | single x double | microneedling with TXA 10% + topical 4% hydroquinone                                                         | topical 4% hydroquinone                                                                                   | N/A | cream nightly for 12 weeks; microneedling sessions every 4 weeks, 4 in total | 55 epidermal                   | Significant decrease in mean MASI scores at week 16 in both groups. Significantly better therapeutic outcomes and patient satisfaction rates in group A than B.                                                                                                                                                            | Erythema and pruritus in both groups.                                                                                             | N/A                                               |
| Ustuner et al(40)      | 2017 | 16, Turkish   | single x double | 1,064-nm QS-Nd:YAG laser + microneedling with vitamin C                                                      | 1,064-nm QS-Nd:YAG laser                                                                                  | N/A | every 4 weeks for 4 months                                                   | 12 mixed 4 dermal              | Significantly lower mean MASI scores, significantly better clinical response as evaluated by the clinician in group A than B at months 1-4. Significant decrease in mean MelasQoL-TR scores in group A.                                                                                                                    | Transient erythema, slight hyperpigmentation in both groups.                                                                      | 5 patients in group A and 7 in group B            |
| Xu et al(41)           | 2017 | 28, Chinese   | single x double | microneedling + topical 0.5% TXA solution                                                                    | topical 0.5% TXA solution                                                                                 | N/A | once weekly for 12 weeks                                                     | N/A                            | Brown spots scores measured by Visia, MI were significantly lower in group A than B at week 12. Physician evaluations of photographs showed better results in group A. Subjective satisfaction scores on both sides increased significantly, with better results in group A.                                               | No obvious adverse reactions.                                                                                                     | N/A                                               |
| Zhao et al(43)         | 2020 | 17, Chinese   | single x single | microneedling with TXA 10%                                                                                   | microneedling with vitamin C 40%                                                                          | N/A | weekly, 8 sessions                                                           | 5 epidermal, 6 dermal, 6 mixed | Significant decrease in MASI scores in both groups.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Mild erythema, localized congestion.                                                                                              | 1 patient at month 2.                             |

**Table 4. Peeling**

| Reference              | Year | Patients: nr, ethnicity | Comparison               | Treatment A                                                                 | Treatment B                                         | Treatment C                                         | Treat. Duration                                                    | Melasma Type                   | Efficacy/ Outcomes                                                                                                                 | Tolerability/ Adverse Events                                                                                                    | Recurrence rates |
|------------------------|------|-------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------|
| Abdel-Meguid et al(44) | 2017 | 24, Egyptian            | single x double          | TCA 20% 25% + solution                                                      | TCA 20% 25%                                         | N/A                                                 | biweekly, 6 sessions                                               | 14 epidermal, 10 mixed         | Significant decrease in MASI score in both groups, with significantly better results in group A.                                   | Erythema, burning sensation, discomfort, pruritus, hyperpigmentation, crustation in both groups.                                | N/A              |
| Dayal et al(45)        | 2017 | 60, Indians             | single x double          | GA peel + 20% AA cream                                                      | 20% AA cream                                        | N/A                                                 | A: every 3 weeks, 8 peeling sessions; B: twice daily, for 24 weeks | 60 epidermal                   | Significant decrease in MASI and MelasQoL scores after week 12 in both groups, but with significantly better results group A.      | Erythema, pruritus, burning sensation, postinflammatory hyperpigmentation and scaling in both groups.                           | N/A              |
| Faghihi et al(46)      | 2017 | 41, Iranian             | single x single          | 20% AA + 10% resorcinol + 6% phytic acid peel on the right side of the face | 50% GA peel on the left side of the face            | N/A                                                 | every 2 weeks, 6 sessions                                          | 19 epidermal 22 mixed          | Marked improvement in MASI scores in both groups. Significantly lower patient discomfort after procedure in group A compared to B. | Group A: No complications. Group B: burning sensation and dyspigmentation.                                                      | N/A              |
| Garg et al(47)         | 2019 | 30, Indians             | single x double x double | 35% GA full-face peel                                                       | 35% GA full-face peel followed by 10% TCA spot peel | 35% GA full-face peel followed by 20% TCA spot peel | every 2 weeks, 4 sessions                                          | epidermal, mixed               | Significant reduction of MASI scores in all groups.                                                                                | Erythema, pruritus, burning sensation, transient hyperpigmentation.                                                             | N/A              |
| Mahajan et al(48)      | 2015 | 40, Indian              | single x single          | TC cream                                                                    | GA peel + 20% AA cream                              | N/A                                                 | for 3 months                                                       | 20 epidermal 13 dermal 7 mixed | Significant reduction in MASI and VAS scores after 6 and 12 weeks of treatment in both groups.                                     | Irritation, increased dryness, photosensitivity in both groups.                                                                 | N/A              |
| [REDACTED] et al       | 2016 | 148, Pakistanese        | single x double          | 20% TCA peel + 5% magnesium ascorbyl phosphate cream                        | 20% TCA peel                                        | N/A                                                 | A, B: weekly, cream once daily; for 6 weeks                        | 148 epidermal                  | Significant MASI score reduction both groups.                                                                                      | N/A                                                                                                                             | N/A              |
| Sahu P et al(50)       | 2017 | 60, Indians             | single x double          | 20% TCA peel + 5% ascorbic acid cream                                       | 20% TCA peel                                        | N/A                                                 | A, B: every two weeks, cream nightly, for 12 weeks                 | 60 epidermal                   | Statistically significant improvement in: MASI, MelasQoL, percentage decrease in MASI, in group A compared to group B.             | Post peeling erythema, burning and stinging sensation, post-inflammatory hyperpigmentation in both groups. Pruritus in group B. |                  |

|                      |      |          |                    |                                    |                                                          |     |                       |          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                             |
|----------------------|------|----------|--------------------|------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|-----|-----------------------|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Vachiramon et al(51) | 2015 | 12, Thai | single x<br>double | LFQS on<br>one side of<br>the face | LFQS +<br>30% GA<br>peel on the<br>contralateral<br>side | N/A | weekly, 5<br>sessions | 12 mixed | Mean<br>relative LI<br>index<br>reduced<br>significantly<br>at week 4 in<br>both<br>treatment<br>groups, but<br>increased at<br>week 8 and<br>week 12.<br>Significant<br>relative LI,<br>MASI score<br>reduction in<br>group B<br>compared to<br>group A. | Burning and<br>stinging sensation<br>on both sides of the<br>face. Superficial<br>skin peeling in<br>group B.<br>Hyperpigmentation,<br>guttate<br>hypopigmentation<br>on the background<br>of<br>hyperpigmentation<br>in both groups. | at week 8<br>and week<br>12 |
|----------------------|------|----------|--------------------|------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|-----|-----------------------|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------|



**Table 5. Topical treatments.**

| Reference            | Year | Patients: nr, ethnicity | Comparison      | Treatment A        | Treatment B           | Treatment C | Treat. Duration       | Melasma Type | Efficacy/ Outcomes                                                                                                                                         | Tolerability/ Adverse Events | Recurrence rates |
|----------------------|------|-------------------------|-----------------|--------------------|-----------------------|-------------|-----------------------|--------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------|
| Adalatkhah et al(52) | 2015 | 74, Swedish             | single x single | 1% flutamide cream | 4% hydroquinone cream | N/A         | nightly, for 4 months | N/A          | Significant decrease in MASI scores in both groups, with better results in group A. Significantly higher patient satisfaction in group A as compared to B. | N/A                          | N/A              |

Accepted Manuscript

Accepted Manuscript

|                        |      |              |                            |             |                                            |                                                                                                      |                                     |                                                                               |                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                    |                                                |
|------------------------|------|--------------|----------------------------|-------------|--------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------|
|                        |      |              |                            |             |                                            | phyti<br>c<br>acid:<br>5% +<br>4N-<br>butyl<br>resorc<br>inol:<br>5% +<br>feruli<br>c<br>acid:<br>2% |                                     |                                                                               |                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                    |                                                |
| Nofal et al(68)        | 2019 | 42, Egyptian | single<br>single<br>single | x<br>x<br>x | silymarin<br>0.7% cream                    | silymarin<br>1.4%<br>cream                                                                           | hydro<br>quino<br>ne<br>4%<br>cream | nightly for 3<br>months                                                       | 34<br>epiderm<br>al 3<br>dermal<br>5 mixed | Significantly reduced<br>MASI scores in all groups.                                                                                                                             | Erythema,<br>burning<br>sensation,<br>scaling in group<br>C. None in<br>groups A or B.             | N/A                                            |
| Pratchyapuri et al(69) | 2016 | 38, Thai     | single<br>single<br>single | x<br>x<br>x | DAB 4%<br>serum                            | HQ 4%<br>cream                                                                                       | HQ 2%<br>cream                      | for weeks 12                                                                  | 15<br>epiderm<br>al 25<br>mixed            | Significant improvement<br>in MASI and MI scores in<br>all groups.                                                                                                              | Erythema,<br>pruritus, skin<br>exfoliation,<br>dryness and<br>hyperpigmentati<br>on in all groups. | N/A                                            |
| Shamsi et al(70)       | 2016 | 44, Iranian  | single<br>single           | x<br>x      | 4% licorice<br>extract cream               | placebo                                                                                              | N/A                                 | for weeks 12                                                                  | N/A                                        | Significant reduction in<br>mMASI scores in both<br>groups.                                                                                                                     | N/A                                                                                                | N/A                                            |
| Taghavi et al(71)      | 2019 | 20, Iranian  | single<br>single           | x<br>x      | topical<br>liposomal<br>hydroquinone<br>4% | conventi<br>onal<br>hydroqui<br>none 4%                                                              | N/A                                 | daily, for 3<br>months                                                        | N/A                                        | Significant reduction in<br>MASI scores in both<br>groups.                                                                                                                      | N/A                                                                                                | N/A                                            |
| Vachiramon et al(72)   | 2020 | 21, Thai     | single<br>single           | x<br>x      | HIFU                                       | 2%<br>hydroqui<br>none<br>cream                                                                      | N/A                                 | HIFU<br>monthly, 3<br>sessions in<br>total, cream<br>nightly, for<br>20 weeks | 21<br>mixed                                | Significant reduction of<br>relative lightness index<br>and MASI in both groups,<br>but with no significant<br>differences between the<br>groups.                               | Burning<br>sensation,<br>scaling,<br>erythema in both<br>groups.                                   | no<br>recurre<br>nces<br>after 3<br>month<br>s |
| Zhang et al(73)        | 2019 | 90, Chinese  | single<br>single<br>single | x<br>x<br>x | herbal cream                               | arbutin<br>cream                                                                                     | place<br>bo                         | twice daily<br>for 12<br>weeks                                                | N/A                                        | Significant decrease in<br>MASI scores in groups A<br>and B, with better results<br>in group A. Significantly<br>reduced EI and density of<br>inflammatory cells in<br>group A. | Mild erythema<br>and pruritus in<br>group B.                                                       | N/A                                            |

**Table 6. Laser and light treatments.**

| Reference                     | Year | Patients: nr, ethnicity | Comparison      | Treatment A                                                              | Treatment B                                            | Treatment C | Treat. Duration                                   | Melasma Type                  | Efficacy/ Outcomes                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Tolerability/ Adverse Events                                                                                               | Recurrence rates                                           |
|-------------------------------|------|-------------------------|-----------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|-------------|---------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|
| Abdel-Raouf Mohamed et al(81) | 2019 | 22, Egyptian            | single x double | FEYL on the right side of the face                                       | FEYL + topical mometasone on the left side of the face | N/A         | laser biweekly, 6 sessions, cream nightly         | 22 epidermal                  | Significant decrease in: MASI scores, basal hyperpigmentation on HE staining, MPSA/ESA percentage on MF staining, MART- 1- positive- stained cells in both groups. MASI scores were significantly lower in group B than A. | N/A                                                                                                                        | N/A                                                        |
| Alavi et al(82)               | 2017 | 41, Iranian             | double x triple | QSNYL-FEYL + topical Klingam formula cream                               | QSNYL + topical Klingam formula cream                  | N/A         | laser biweekly, 4 sessions, cream nightly         | N/A                           | Significantly lighter skin colour and decrease in melanin content in both groups with significantly better results in group A than B.                                                                                      | None reported.                                                                                                             | N/A                                                        |
| Badawi et al(83)              | 2018 | 30, French              | single x double | FEYL + 4% HQ cream                                                       | 4% HQ cream                                            | N/A         | laser biweekly, 6 sessions, cream twice daily     | 15 epidermal 6 dermal 9 mixed | Significantly higher decrease in the degree of pigmentation on the 4-point scale and MASI scores in group A than B.                                                                                                        | Transient and mild erythema, burning sensation, and itching were reported in both groups. Superficial crusting in group A. | 2 patients in both groups.                                 |
| Bae et al(75)                 | 2015 | 20, Korean              | single x single | 10 J/cm2 fluence IPL                                                     | 13 J/cm2 fluence IPL                                   | N/A         | weekly, 6 sessions                                | N/A                           | Significant decrease in MASI scores and melanin index in both groups, with no significant differences between the groups.                                                                                                  | Transient and mild erythema, burning sensation in both groups.                                                             | N/A                                                        |
| Barolet et al(76)             | 2018 | 7, Canadian             | single x double | microderm abrasion + photobiomodulation LED device                       | microderm abrasion                                     | N/A         | weekly, for 8 weeks                               | 7 dermal                      | Statistically significant pigment reduction in group A than B. Significant reduction in MASI score in group A at week 12.                                                                                                  | N/A                                                                                                                        | N/A                                                        |
| Chalermchai et al(84)         | 2018 | 30, Thai                | single x double | fractional picosecond 1,064 nm laser + 4% HQ cream                       | 4% HQ cream                                            | N/A         | laser monthly, cream daily                        | N/A                           | Significantly decreased mMASI scores at the 12-week visit in group A than B.                                                                                                                                               | Transient mild erythema, mild skin desquamation, mild burning sensation in group A.                                        | N/A                                                        |
| Choi et al(86)                | 2015 | 360, Korean             | single x double | dual toning: LFQSNYL + LPNYL 1064 nm                                     | QS toning= LFQSNYL                                     | N/A         | weekly, 10 sessions                               | N/A                           | Significant median decrease of mMASI in group A as compared to B. Significantly lower adverse events in group A than B.                                                                                                    | Mottled hypopigmentation and rebound hyperpigmentation in both groups.                                                     | N/A                                                        |
| Choi et al.(85)               | 2017 | 74, Korean              | single x double | picosecond laser with dual-wavelengths (1 064 and 595 nm) + 2 % HQ cream | 2% HQ cream                                            | N/A         | laser weekly, 5 sessions, cream daily for 7 weeks | N/A                           | Significant improvement in RL*I, significant decrease of mMASI scores, better subjective satisfaction rates in group A than B.                                                                                             | Mild dermatitis in both groups. Mild pain during laser treatment and mild erythema in group A.                             | 30/39 in group A and 27/39 (69.23%) in group B at week 18. |
| Chung et al(77)               | 2016 | 13, Korean              | single x double | IPL + topical TXA 2%                                                     | IPL                                                    | N/A         | monthly, 4 sessions                               | N/A                           | Significant decrease in MI and mMASI in group A.                                                                                                                                                                           | None reported.                                                                                                             | N/A                                                        |

|                      |      |               |                                |                                                                 |                                                              |               |                                                                      |                                 |                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                     |                                                                               |
|----------------------|------|---------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------|---------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Garg et al(99)       | 2019 | 60, Indian    | single x<br>single x<br>single | SSR 540 nm                                                      | PQSNYL 1064 nm                                               | APEYL 2940 nm | at 3 weeks interval, 5 sessions                                      | 22 epidermal 12 dermal 26 mixed | Significantly decreased mMASI scores in all 3 groups, with better results in group C.                                                                                     | group A: transient dryness. Group B, C: post-inflammatory hyperpigmentation, acne brakouts. Group C: herpes labialis.               | N/A                                                                           |
| Guo et al(87)        | 2019 | 12, Chinese   | single x<br>single             | QSNYL 1064-nm Q-PTP mode on the right side                      | QSNYL 1064-nm single-pulse mode on the left side             | N/A           | at 4 weeks interval, 5 sessions                                      | N/A                             | Significant decrease in mean mMASI scores at week 4 and 12 in both groups.                                                                                                | Significantly lower pain and erythema in group A compared to B. Urticaria and petechiae in group B.                                 | 3 patients at week 12.                                                        |
| Hammani et al(88)    | 2015 | 16, French    | single x<br>double             | copper bromide laser + Kligman formula triple combination cream | Kligman formula triple combination cream                     | N/A           | laser at 2-3 weeks interval, 4 sessions, cream daily for 4 months    | N/A                             | Significantly better decrease in MASI scores in group B than A at the end of the treatment.                                                                               | N/A                                                                                                                                 | 100% recurrence rates at 6 months follow-up.                                  |
| Hassan et al(78)     | 2018 | 28, Egyptian  | single x<br>single             | PDL on the right hemiface                                       | IPL on the left hemiface                                     | N/A           | at 3-5 weeks interval                                                | 20 epidermal 8 mixed            | Significant reduction in hemifacial mMASI scores in both groups with no significant difference between them. Better patient tolerance and satisfaction in group B than A. | Mild erythema, edema and pain during and after treatment, microcrust formation, post-inflammatory hyperpigmentation in both groups. | N/A                                                                           |
| Kong et al(89)       | 2017 | 17, Korean    | single x<br>double             | PDL + LFQSNYL                                                   | LFQSNYL                                                      | N/A           | QSNY weekly, 9 sessions, PDL at 4 weeks interval, 3 sessions         | N/A                             | Significant decrease in MASI scores in both groups.                                                                                                                       | Mild burning sensation and erythema in both groups. Focal purpura, postinflammatory hyperpigmentation in group A.                   | 1 patient at week 16 in group A.                                              |
| Laothaworn et al(90) | 2018 | 25, Thai      | single x<br>double             | 1064-nm QSNYL + 3% TXA cream                                    | 1064-nm QSNYL                                                | N/A           | laser at 4 weeks interval, 2 sessions, cream twice daily for 8 weeks | 14 mixed 11 epidermal           | Significant decrease in MASI scores in group A. Significant decrease in mean MI in group A at week 4.                                                                     | Mild erythema and burning sensations in both groups.                                                                                | Rebound at week 8 shown by increased MI starting after week 4 in both groups. |
| Lee et al(91)        | 2015 | 8, Taiwanese  | single x<br>double             | QSNYL 1,064 nm                                                  | QSNYL 1,064 nm + ultrasonic application of topical vitamin C | N/A           | monthly, 4 sessions                                                  | N/A                             | Significant improvement in group B compared to A in both patient and physician assessment.                                                                                | None reported.                                                                                                                      | No rebound at 3 month follow-up.                                              |
| Lee et al(92)        | 2018 | 12, Taiwanese | single x<br>single             | picosecond 755 nm alexandrite laser                             | QSNYL 1064 nm                                                | N/A           | monthly, 4 sessions                                                  | dermal, mixed                   | Significant improvement in group A compared to B, according to both physician and patient assessment.                                                                     | Temporary erythema.                                                                                                                 | None reported.                                                                |
| Nourmohammadi        | 2019 | 37, Iranian   | single x<br>double             | HQ 4% cream +                                                   | HQ 4% cream                                                  | N/A           | laser at 3 week                                                      | N/A                             | Significant reduction in darkness at week 3 in                                                                                                                            | Erythema and burning                                                                                                                | N/A                                                                           |

|                       |      |                 |                          |                               |                                                            |                                |                                           |              |                                                                                                                       |                                                                                        |     |
|-----------------------|------|-----------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------------------------|--------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| et al(93)             |      |                 |                          | fractional CO2 laser          |                                                            |                                | interval, 3 sessions, cream               |              | group A and at week 6 in group B. Reduction in homogeneity became significant at week 6 in both groups.               | sensation.                                                                             |     |
| Shakeeb et al(79)     | 2018 | 96, Pakistanese | single x single x double | triple combination cream      | IPL                                                        | IPL + triple combination cream | cream nightly, IPL biweekly, for 2 months | 96 epidermal | Significantly better MASI score reduction in group C than A or B.                                                     | N/A                                                                                    | N/A |
| Tawfic Set al(94)     | 2019 | 28, Egyptian    | single x double          | fractional ablative CO2 laser | fractional ablative CO2 laser + microneedling with TXA 10% | N/A                            | every 4-6 weeks, 5 sessions               | N/A          | Significant reduction in mean MASI, MI and EI scores in group A. Significant reduction in mean MASI score in group B. | Mild burning sensation in both groups. Post-inflammatory hyperpigmentation in group B. | N/A |
| Vachiram on et al(51) | 2015 | 18, Thai        | single x double          | LFQSNYL + IPL                 | LFQSNYL                                                    | N/A                            | LFQS weekly, 5                            |              |                                                                                                                       |                                                                                        |     |

## Figure legends

Figure 1. Literature search and article selection.

